

Article

Representation of Women and Gender in the Pranami Discourses and Narratives of The Mughal Period

Mohd Rehmatullah^{1*}

1. Department of History,
NCWEB-DU, Delhi, India.

*Corresponding Author: sam123.abu@gmail.com

Article History

Received: 14-06-2024

Revised: 29-08-2024

Accepted: 10-09-2024

Published: 15-09-2024



DOI: [10.63960/sp.2024.sijmds.1.2.29](https://doi.org/10.63960/sp.2024.sijmds.1.2.29)

Abstract:

Narratives and discourses in the Pranami literary traditions, Bani (Utterances of Pran Nath, prominent figure of Pranami 'sect' in 17th-century India) and Bitak (Hagiographical compositions of close disciples of Pran Nath), depict both overtly and covertly various incidents involving images of women and gender relations in 17th- and 18th-century South Asia. Through these representations in the Pranami narratives, this paper attempts to scrutinize the intricacies of gender relations in which identities and meanings are constructed in multiple and layered ways around descriptions of incidents. This paper also investigates nuanced and contextualized accounts of how the representation of women and gender in the Pranami discourses and narratives of the Mughal period reflects a 'progressive' and inclusive perspective that values the agency and contributions of women in religious and social spheres. In the 17th and 18th centuries in Mughal India, including the context of regional kingdoms like Bundelkhanda, this paper explores how the Pranami literary traditions, which emphasized the equality of all individuals, regardless of gender, caste, religious, and social status, imagined a world of social, political, and religious relationships that could be appropriated within a wider framework of given contexts and situations. This approach stands in contrast to the prevailing gender norms of the time and provides insight into alternative visions of gender equality and inclusivity during the Mughal period.

Keywords:

Representations, Constructions, Gender, Women, Pranami Ideas, Mughal Period, Indian History

1. INTRODUCTION

In relation to Mughal India and regional kingdoms like Bundelkhanda in the 17th and 18th centuries, Pranami literary traditions are significant historical records that emphasize the equality of all human beings, regardless of gender, caste, religious, and social status. What was also imagined in these literary accounts was a world of social, political, religious, and gender relationships that could be appropriated within different contexts and situations. The Pranami approach in the context of gender relations stands in contrast to the prevailing gender norms of the time and provides insight into alternative visions of gender equality and inclusiveness during the Mughal period. Research on gender in Mughal South Asia has been largely on themes like the nature of harem, elite women, and constructions of elite masculinity. Firstly, the function of the harem was

highlighted in restricting the political, economic, and social roles of women. Secondly, it was also debated how normative masculinity was at work during the Mughal period, depending on the likes and dislikes of the Mughal emperors in the broader social and political contexts.

2. MUGHAL INDIA, GENDER AND HISTORIOGRAPHY

The representation of women and gender relations in modern historiography for the 17th century has been studied from two different perspectives. One approach has mainly dealt with themes like status of women in a particular time period and role and contribution of women to various spheres like society, culture, economy and politics. Second paradigm, a recent one, was embedded in reading the discursive text of various narratives and literary

texts in connection with the ideas of 'self' and 'other' in relation to the context of European history. This approach has encompassed themes like chastity and sensuality of women in South Asia and beyond, notions of masculinity, the practice of sati, inclination of women from various communities, to mention a few. The theme of harem has also been argumentatively dealt with by scholars like Ruby Lal by confronting its stereotypical perception by showing that the image and role of women were complex and gender relations not only worked but also evolved during this time. She has challenged the notion of separate 'public' and 'private' spheres in the early Mughal context underscoring the dynamic nature of political activities within the harem and also significant role of harem in the making of the Mughal imperious. However, from Akbar's time onwards, she argued, the situation has dramatically changed.¹ In contrast to Lal's argument, Balabanlilar has emphasized that the Central Asian traditions were continued by elite Mughal women in economic, social and political life of the empire as a part of "greater Timurid cultural and social legacy".² It has also been maintained by scholars like Gregory Kozlowski that in spite of practices of elite seclusion, Mughal women have been instrumental in various public and religious works as part of their patronage culture for mosques, shrines and caravanserais.³ The identity of woman has also been studied with the multiple notions of 'self' and 'other'.⁴ The historiographical focus on women of recent times has been on the dimensions of 'masculine/feminine'. Rosalind O' Hanlon has argued that the notions of masculinity and morality from Akbar's time onwards restricted women more in the courtly and state activities.⁵ Many of these studies have taken up the themes of either Mughal women or Non-Mughal elite women as the subject of their research. Moosvi has provided an insight into female labour both within elite households and outside of it ranging from building construction and agriculture work, textile production and inn-keeping to dance performance and domestic work.⁶ Historians have also attempted to understand and explain seventeenth-century texts like travel accounts in case of women's images and gender relations in terms of 'Hindu'

and 'Muslim' as separate religious identities.⁷ Apart from these involvements and interactions, there was also a world of women and intricacies of gender relationship which were interacting and evolving during 17th century India that can be understood and analysed by reading pranami literary texts. In the lack of the female voice and its representation in the historical sources of 17th century India⁸, although there are literary records from European travellers like Bernier⁹, Tavernier¹⁰ and Manucchi¹¹, to mention a few, and Persian sources which were penned by courtiers and members of the Mughals, pranami literary traditions and narratives provide various incidents involving women in their everyday life and activities in multiple forms. The European travellers have mentioned in their accounts that there was a clear-cut division between the public domain of politics and private sphere of women.¹² The images and activities of women in the descriptions of the pranami texts are helpful to understand and analyse the nuanced dimensions of gender relations in 17th-18th century India. The bani and bitak compositions of the pranami literary traditions can also be utilized in the case of connected histories¹³ because they provide descriptions of scattered nature in the context of time and space in terms of gender relations.

3. PRANAMI 'SECT' AND THE MUGHAL EMPIRE

The Pranami 'sect', which emerged and evolved during the Mughal period, had a distinct perspective on the representation of women and the construction of gender relations. This inclusive approach is reflected in the discourses and narratives of the Pranami ideas and practices, which often represented women as active participants in religious and social life. In Pranami discourses, women were portrayed as spiritual seekers and devotees, with the ability to attain enlightenment and spiritual fulfilment as well. The Pranami ideas did not emphasize the external markers of identity such as gender or social status. Rather women were encouraged to actively engage in religious practices, including prayer and participation in community rituals.

- 1 Ruby Lal, *Domesticity and Power in the Early Mughal Empire*, Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, 2005.
- 2 Balabanlilar, Lisa, "Begins of the Mystic Feast: Turco-Mongol Tradition in the Mughal Harem," *The Journal of Asian Studies* 69,1, 2010, pp-130-132.
- 3 Gregory Kozlowski, "Private Lives and Public Piety," in Gavin Hambly, ed., *Women in the Medieval Islamic World*, St. Martin Press, New York, 1998.
- 4 Sanjay Subrahmanyam, "Three Ways of Being Alien: Travels and Encounters in the Early Modern World", Brandies University Press, Waltham, Massachusetts, USA, 2011.
- 5 Rosalind O' Hanlon, "Kingdom, Household and Body: History, Gender and Imperial Service under Akbar, MAS, 41 (5), 2007, pp. 889-923.
- 6 Shireen Moosvi, "Work and Gender in Mughal India: People, Taxation and Trade in Mughal India", Oxford University Press, Oxford, 2008, pp. 135-158.
- 7 Kate Teltscher, 'Indian Women: The Seventeenth-Century European Fantasy', in *India Inscribed: European and British Writing on India, 1600-1800*, Oxford, Oxford University Press, 1995.
- 8 Rekha Misra, 'Women in Mughal India (1526-1748 AD)', Munshiram Manoharlal, Delhi, 1967
- 9 Bernier, *Travels in the Mogul Empire AD1656-1668*, edited by V. Smith, second edition, 1934.
- 10 Tavernier, *Travels in India*, edited by William Crooke, second edition, 1925.
- 11 Manucci, *Storia do Mogor*, edited by William Irvine, 1907-08.
- 12 Salim Kidwai, "Sultans, Eunuchs and Domesticity: New Foes of Bondage in Medieval India," in, *Chains of Servitude*, Sangam Books, Madras, 1985; K. S. Lal, *The Mughal Harem*, Aditya Prakashan, New Delhi, 1988; Soma Mukherjee, *Royal Mughal Ladies and Their Contributions*, Gyan Publication House, New Delhi, 2001; Renuka Nath, *Notable Mughal and Hindu Women in the 16th and 17th Centuries A.D.*, Inter-India Publication, New Delhi, 1990; B. P. Saha, *Princesses, Begums and Concubines*, Vikas Publication House, New Delhi, 1992.
- 13 Sanjay Subrahmanyam, 'Explorations in Connected Histories: From the Tagos to the Ganges, 2 Vols. OUP, University of Michigan, 2005.

The Pranami tradition's approach to gender representation challenged traditional patriarchal norms and provided a more inclusive and egalitarian vision of society in 17th-18th century India. Women were seen as equal partners in both spiritual and social endeavours.

During the Mughal period, women were portrayed in various roles and positions in society and politics. Representation of women in art, literature and historical records provides insight into their image, status and influence during the Mughal era. In the Mughal court, women held crucial roles as queens, princesses, and other female relatives of the emperor. Their influence was significant behind the scenes and were involved in political decision-making also. In art and literature produced in the Mughal court and outside, a typical image of women was often portrayed as symbols of beauty, grace, and femininity. They were also depicted in various settings like in gardens, palaces, and domestic scenes, stressing their roles as wives, mothers, and companions. Women were at times also celebrated for their intellect and talents as many Mughal emperors patronized female poets, musicians, and artists. But what is more crucial in this context is that the representation of women in the Mughal period was influenced by the existing patriarchal norms and societal expectations. Women in general were expected to adhere to conventional gender roles and were often restricted to the domestic sphere. However, elite women of the ruling class had access to education, cultural pursuits, and opportunities for personal expression. On the whole, the representation of women in the Mughal period reflects an intricate relationship of power dynamics, social norms, and cultural values. While women were often celebrated, to some extent, for their contributions and achievements, their *agency*, *autonomy* and *gender dimensions* were also constrained by the prevailing gender norms of the time.

4. NOTIONS OF THE IMAGE OF WOMEN AND GENDER RELATIONS IN PRANAMI LITERARY TEXTS

There are references, descriptions and events in the pranami literary traditions which can be contextualized in the case of images of women and gender relations during 17th-18th century India. Descriptions involving women and gender relations can be found right from the last days of Devchand who was guru of Pran Nath. Devchand, as is mentioned in pranami literature, instructed Pran Nath to carefully search and find those who are ignorant beings (souls) worldwide and enlighten them. But what is more important here is that the responsibility Pran Nath was invested in also came with the issue of the successorship (Gaddi) which was contested by Biharidas, son of Devchand, from 1655 AD onwards. The issue of successorship became intense between Pran Nath and Biharidas and in the course of time, created differences and controversies between them. At the same time, on account of the dispute in relation to the issue

of successorship, it also became clear how the image of women were perceived by both Biharidas and Pran Nath. Biharidas was more patriarchal and conservative and wanted to put women and lower castes outside of pranami following but Pran Nath vehemently opposed him. Scholars like Krishnadutta who have worked on pranami ideas and community were of the opinion that Biharidas was not happy when Devchand did not give him any responsibility.¹⁴ Finally, Devchand made Pran Nath his religious successor in samvat 1712 (4th September, 1655 AD). On the same day, as mentioned, Devchand died. Apparently, it was a issue related to internal organisation but within a larger context, what was involved and embedded here was political, social and gender contexts as well because the disagreement and consequently conflict between Biharidas and Pran Nath depicted their attitude towards image and status of women. In this context, Beetak writers explain the above development in the following way:

सम्बत सत्रह बरोतरे , भाँदो मास उजाला पख
चतुर दसी बुधवारी भई, हुए धनी अलख¹⁵

Bihari was not happy when Pran Nath was made the successor of Devchand. So, to solve this dispute so that tension between them and among the followers, Pran Nath left the Gaddi for the sake of Biharidas and engaged him in spreading the religious ideology. Navrang swami¹⁶ mentions that three years after the death of Devchand, Bihari was made successor in samvat 1715 (1658 AD). But both Laldas and Brajbhooshan mention that Bihari became successor in the same year samvat 1712 Ashwin Mas (1655 AD). After the death of Devchand and a dispute with Biharidas, Pran Nath accepted the wizarat of Jamnagar. Although he became the wazir of Jamnagar, he had discussions with the followers of the pranami Sampradaya ('sect') almost every day. As mentioned, Biharidas was jealous of the increasing attachment of the followers to Pran Nath. In the course of time, Biharidas also made it compulsory for every follower to attend the dharmacharcha (religious discussion) regularly. Those who did not follow the rules had to leave the sampradaya. According to a legend, one day a follower from a far away village was punished based on the same rule. The same follower kept on standing outside Bihari's house for nine days without any food. On the 10th day, he visited Pran Nath's house but at that time, Pran Nath was in the court. Phoolbai, Pran Nath's wife, gave him suggestions, along with food. After having heard of this, Bihari lost his temper and ordered his guard not to permit Pran Nath to enter the temple. When Pran Nath reached there, he was told by Bihari that he had to leave his wife permanently. Pran Nath followed the orders of his guru's son. Phoolbai went on fasting and finally died. Before her death, she said that the place where she was given the last rite was to be washed with the foot of her husband, according to Krishnadutta Shastri.¹⁷ So on the basis of this reference, it can also be pointed out that patriarchal norms and values

14 Krishna Dutta Shashtri, Nijananda Charitaamrat, Jamnagar, Navtanpuri, p. 356.

15 Laldas, Beetak, (A.D. 1700), (eds.), Jayaswal, Matabadal and Devkrishna Sharma, Panna, Allahabad, Pranami Sahitya Sansthan, 1966, P7, CH 16.

16 Navrang Swami (Swami Mukund Das), Beetak, (ed.), Mehta, Vimla and Mohan Pricharya, Delhi, Prannath Mission, 2006, P (Prakaran)13, CH (Chopai) 3.

17 Krishna Dutta Shashtri, Nijananda Charitaamrat, pp. 376-380.

where male as a husband were treated as master were in practice during that time. Even, at times, Pran Nath was stick to the patriarchal norms and organisational rules which were against the agency and autonomy of women and created hierarchical and unequal relationship between male and female, on the one hand while between husband and wife, on the other. Furthermore, on account of some climatic disturbances, the task of the dissemination of religious ideas was stopped.

A letter has been sent here to Pran Nath by Bihari from Jamnagar. Through this letter, three rules were said to be followed within the pranami organisation as the core ideas which depict how women should be treated and perceived. The communication between them also reflected the nature and complexities of gender relations that were taking place during that time. There are various but scattered incidents where nuanced understanding about the image of women and gender relations can be contextualized. It also depicted the state of mentalities of religious figures of how they perceived women differently in different contexts. The verse in relation to the conversation between Biharidas and Pran Nath is as follows:

हम तुम बिन यह तारतम, कबहू कहै न कोई
नीच जात को तारतम, कहिये निह दोई
पुन को उन विधवा वधु, ता प्रित कहोन आप
ये तीनो बातें करो, उत्तम बड़े प्रताप¹⁸

There are also verses as above in this text as follows:

एक तो नीच जात को, सुनाईयो नही तारतम
दूजे रांड स्त्री को, तीजे कहें हम तुम

The above verse can be read in the following way:

1. The lower section of society is not permitted to listen

DECLARATIONS

Author(s) Contribution

Single author work.

Uses of AI Acknowledgement

Not Used

Funding Information

No government, commercial or non-profit funding agency had funds to finance the study.

Availability of Data and Materials

Source are cited in footnotes.

REFERENCES

Balabanlilar, L. (2010). Begims of the mystic feast: Turco-Mongol tradition in the Mughal harem. *The Journal of Asian Studies*, 69(1), 130-132.

and recite the Tartam Mantra (verses from Kuljam Swaroop).

2. Even the widows do not have any right to listen to it.
3. Nobody other than you (Pran Nath) and me (Bihari) has the right to take over the process of initiation.

But Pran Nath in his reply to Biharidas opposed all the above norms, as is mentioned in the following verse:

देवचन्द्र के धर्म को, हिरदे करो विचार
उत्तर जो त्रय बात को, स मुमिन परे तब सार/
बाह्य द्रष्टि को छोड़ के, नजर करि निज नूर
देख्यो नित अंकुर को, बक स्यो तहाँ हुजुर/
प्रगट लखी है बात तुम, भवन वधु कुल जान
परखी ताकि वासना दयो तारतम ज्ञान/
विधवा दारा वह हती, नीच असुर की जात
नजर करी अंकुर पर, बाई रही सुजात¹⁹

It is also mentioned that Pran Nath, after having given an example of Devchand who had educated one Khojibai, replied to a question that there was not any barrier or discrimination in the process of education or initiation which Devchand had done so far as widows, male-female and varna (caste). Pran Nath sent a text as a response in the form of 'Kalash' which was written in Surat. But Bihari was irritated, as mentioned, by this response and he even returned that text from Jamnagar as is in the following verse:

तुम संबंध हमारो छोड़्यो, आत्संबंध श्रीदेवचन्द्र
से जोड़्यो
ग्रही सबे उनकी तुम बातें, छोड़ी सब हमरी
विरव्याते²⁰

Competing Interests

Author declare that they have no known competing financial interests or personal relationships that could have appeared to influence the work reported in this paper.

Clinical Trial Registration (if applicable)

Not Applicable

Human Ethics and Consent to Participate

The study did not involve any clinical interventions or experiments requiring formal ethical approval.

18 Brajbhooshan, Vratant MuktaVali, (A.D. 1698), (ed.), Bajpeyi, Dr. B. P. and Vimla Mehta, Panna, Shri Krishna Pranami Dham, 1998, P 49, CH 5-6.

19 Brajbhooshan, Vritant MuktaVali, P 49, CH 5-6.

20 Saneh Sakhi ki Beetak, Leelaras Sagar, (eds.), Hari Prasad and Amritraj Sharma, 1983, p. 55.

& V. Mehta, Eds.). Shri Krishna Pranami Dham.

Vikas Publication House.

- Dutta Shashtri, K. (1966). *Nijananda Charitaamrat* (Panna, Navtanpuri).
- Kozlowski, G. (1998). *Private lives and public piety*. In G. Hambly (Ed.), *Women in the Medieval Islamic World* (pp. 47-59). St. Martin Press.
- Lal, R. (2005). *Domesticity and power in the early Mughal Empire*. Cambridge University Press.
- Manucci, A. (1907-08). *Storia do Mogor* (W. Irvine, Ed.).
- Misra, R. (1967). *Women in Mughal India (1526-1748 AD)*. Munshiram Manoharlal.
- Moosvi, S. (2008). *Work and gender in Mughal India: People, taxation, and trade in Mughal India*. Oxford University Press, 135-158.
- Mukherjee, S. (2001). *Royal Mughal Ladies and Their Contributions*. Gyan Publication House.
- Nath, R. (1990). *Notable Mughal and Hindu Women in the 16th and 17th Centuries A.D.* Inter-India Publication.
- O'Hanlon, R. (2007). *Kingdom, household, and body: History, gender, and imperial service under Akbar*. MAS, 41(5), 889-923.
- Saha, B. P. (1992). *Princesses, Begums and Concubines*. Salim Kidwai. (1985). *Sultans, eunuchs, and domestics: New forms of bondage in medieval India*. In *Chains of Servitude*. Sangam Books.
- Sakhi, S. (1983). *Saneh Sakhi ki Beetak* (H. Prasad & A. Sharma, Eds.). Leelaras Sagar.
- Subrahmanyam, S. (2005). *Explorations in connected histories: From the Tagos to the Ganges* (Vols. 1-2). Oxford University Press.
- Subrahmanyam, S. (2011). *Three ways of being alien: Travels and encounters in the early modern world*. Brandeis University Press.
- Tavernier, J. (1925). *Travels in India* (W. Crooke, Ed.; 2nd ed.).
- Teltscher, K. (1995). *Indian women: The seventeenth-century European fantasy*. In *India Inscribed: European and British Writing on India, 1600-1800*. Oxford University Press.
- Tushar, S. (2006). *Beetak* (V. Mehta & M. Pricharya, Eds.). Prannath Mission.
- Vratant Muktavali, B. (1698). (Bajpeyi, B. P., & V. Mehta, Eds.). Panna, Shri Krishna Pranami Dham.

Disclaimer/Publisher's Note: The statements, opinions, and data contained in all publications are solely those of the individual author(s) and contributor(s) and do not necessarily reflect the views of Synergy Publication or the editor(s) of the journal. While reasonable editorial and peer-review procedures are followed, Synergy Publication and the editor(s) do not endorse any products, methods, or claims described in the content.

Author Bio:

1. Dr. Mohd Rehmatullah is an Indian historian, researcher, and academic scholar specializing in medieval and early modern cultural history, religious syncretism, and Indo-Persian literary traditions. He was awarded his Ph.D. from the Department of History and Culture at Jamia Millia Islamia in New Delhi. His doctoral research and broader academic work explore how distinct religious and linguistic identities intersected to foster hybrid cultural spaces in historical India.